

**A SUBTITLING ANALYSIS ON MAXIM FLOUTS IN
A CINDERELLA STORY AND *THE PERFECT MAN* MOVIES FROM
ENGLISH INTO INDONESIAN**



PUBLICATION ARTICLE

**Submitted as a Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements
for Getting Master Degree of Education
in English Department**

by:

**FRIDA ALFANI MASLAHAH
S200 120 026**

**POST GRADUATED- ENGLISH DEPARTMENT
MUHAMMADIYAH UNIVERSITY OF SURAKARTA**

2013

APPROVAL

PUBLICATION ARTICLE

**A SUBTITLING ANALYSIS ON MAXIM FLOUTS IN
A CINDERELLA STORY AND THE PERFECT MAN MOVIES FROM ENGLISH INTO
INDONESIAN**

Proposed by:

FRIDA ALFANI MASLAHAH
S200 120 026

Surakarta, July 2014

Approved to be Examined by:

First Consultant



Agus Wijayanto, M.A, Ph.D

Second Consultant



Dr. Anam Sutopo, M.Hum

**A SUBTITLING ANALYSIS ON MAXIM FLOUTS IN
A CINDERELLA STORY AND THE PERFECT MAN MOVIES FROM ENGLISH INTO
INDONESIAN**

**FRIDA ALFANI MASLAHAH
S200 120 026**

Post Graduated- English Department
Muhammadiyah University Of Surakarta
frida18am@gmail.com

Abstract

The study aims to describe (1) maxim flouts found in *A Cinderella Story* and *The Perfect Man* Movies from English to Indonesian, (2) the accuracy of maxim flouts translation in *A Cinderella Story* and *The Perfect Man* Movies from English to Indonesian, (3) the acceptability of maxim flouts translation in *A Cinderella Story* and *The Perfect Man* Movies from English to Indonesian, and (4) the readability of maxim flouts translation in *A Cinderella Story* and *The Perfect Man* Movies from English to Indonesian. The type of this study is a descriptive qualitative. The data were obtained from several methods such as, content analysis, questionnaire, and interview. The strategy applied in this study is an embedded case study. The data are maxim flouts in *A Cinderella Story* and *The Perfect Man* Movies and its translation on the VCD of both movies. The results of the study show that firstly, there are 3 kinds of maxim flouts found in *A Cinderella Story* movie, they are flouts of quality maxim, flouts of relation maxim, and flouts of manner maxim. Then, *The Perfect Man* movie has four types of maxim flouts, there are flouts of quality maxim, flouts of quantity maxim, flouts of relation maxim, and flouts of manner maxim. From 57, they are 38 data or 66.67% belong to flouts of quality maxim, 3 data or 5.26% belong to flouts of quantity maxim, 12 data or 21.05% belong to flouts of relation maxim, and 4 data or 7.01% belong to flouts of manner maxim. The most commonly found type in both movies is flouts of

quality maxim. Secondly, from 57 data the number of accurate data is 31 or about 54.39%, and the number of less accurate data is 26 or 45.61 %. Thirdly, the level of acceptable maxim flouts data is good, because 36 or about 63.16% maxim flouts data are acceptable for the viewer, then 21 or about 36.84% data belong to less acceptable. Fourthly, the result of readability is 31 or about 54.39 % readable, and 26 or about 45.61% less readable. It means almost maxim flouts are readable.

Key Words : Subtitling, Maxim, Flouts, Shift, Accuracy, Acceptability, Readability.

1. Introduction

A Creative teacher makes variations in his teaching and learning process. One of the variations is media of learning process. Movie could be an interesting medium. Function of movie as entertainment is proved in the interest of many people watching movie. Most movies use English language. However, the viewers of movie come from different countries that have different language background. Therefore, movie needs media in order to make the viewers understand the movie. According to Bell, translation is a process which transforms a text originally in one language into an equivalent text in a different language, but does not change the content of the message and the formal features and functional rules of the original text.

According to Ghaemi and Benjamin (2010), subtitling has the quickest method and the most economical to implementation. The subtitling has limitation to write in the screen. The rule of limitation subtitling is very necessary in order to the picture and the dialogue can match. The effect of synchronization of the subtitling is that the audience can enjoy watching the movie. Context is needed to interpret utterances or sentences from source language to target language, because without context, the sentences could have variation meaning. Some people expect conversation activities and efficient language. However, in the society phenomenon

about some people blatantly say unclear utterance and wish the hearers could infer them by themselves. This phenomenon is called maxim flouts.

According to Catford (2004: 43) translation is the replacement of textual material in one language (Source Language) by equivalent textual material in another language (target language). This opinion points out that the general translation is textual material. He thinks that the result of translation should replace the position of source language. But the requirement of that situation is equivalent. The process of searching equivalence is part of translation. Koller argued that equivalence is used in the sense of sameness of value between target language and a source language.

In translation process, the translators change the surface structure of the text, there are word, phrase, clause, and sentence, in order to convey as similar as the deep structure of source language that contain meaning, information, and message. The translators can not attach lexical or grammatical form of source language, so they should reexpress the meaning in order to the receptor understand the contain.

One of the requirement ideal translations is accuracy. This term could be used to evaluate translation, because it can measure the result of translation appropriate as exactly as possible with the meaning of the source text. According to Fadee (2011), accuracy of translation means that a translated piece communicates the same meaning as the source language. Accuracy connected to message of source language that convey to target language.

Acceptability could be approach to target reader where translation follows norm of the target language and culture. It is evident that culture, language norms

and the reader feedback to a translation are determinant features of acceptability for a translation.

Readability, according to Richard, refers to how easily written materials can be read and understood. A similar point is also made by Dale and Chall who state that “readability is the sum total of all those elements within a given piece of printed material that effects the success a group of readers have with it” (Cited Flood in Nababan, 2004: 53). According to the researcher readability is measure of easy the watcher understand of text and catch the meaning.

The advantage of Subtitling is the quickest and the most economical to implement. Because of this reason, subtitling becomes choice of transferring language the most movies. This research analyzes about subtitling, so the understanding about subtitling is necessary. Luyken et al (1991: 31) define subtitling as condensed written translations of the original dialogue which appear as lines of text, usually positioned toward the foot of the screen.

An implicature is certainly a prime example of more being communicated than is said. Implicature has been invoked for a variety of purposes, from defending controversial semantic claims in philosophy to explaining lexical gaps in linguistics. H. P. Grice, who coined the term “implicature,” and classified the phenomenon, developed an influential theory to explain and predict conversational implicatures, and describes how they arise and are understood. The Cooperative Principle and associated maxims play a central role.

As a field of language study, pragmatics is fairly new. The term “pragmatics” has an interesting history in philosophy and linguistics and is undergoing rapid development. Pragmatics is the study of the use of context to make inferences about meaning (Fasold, 1993: 119). This study can be the way of investigating

meaning beyond the words. The hearer more to do from the analysis what the speaker means by speaker utterances than what word or phrases in the utterances meaning. This study need interpretation of what speaker mean in particular context and how context influences the speaker says.

Cooperative principle is one of the concept in pragmatics. This concept helps implicate utterance is explained. Grice developed a theory designed to explain and predict conversational implicatures. He also sought to describe how such implicatures are understood. Grice (1975: 26–30) postulated a general *Cooperative Principle* and four *maxims* specifying how to be cooperative.

Logic and Grice proposed for maxims :

1) Maxim of Quantity

Submaxim : a) Make your contribution as informative as is required (for the current purposes of the exchange)

b) Do not make your contribution more informative than is required.

2) Maxim of Quality

Try to make your contribution one that is true.

Submaxim: a) Do not say what you believe to be false

b) Do not say that for which you lack adequate evidence.

3) Maxim of Relation : be relevant

4) Maxim of Manner : be perspicuous

Submaxim : a) Avoid obscurity of expression

b) Avoid ambiguity

c) Be brief (avoid unnecessary prolixity); and

d) Be orderly

Grice well aware that there are many occasions when people fail to observe the maxims. There are five ways of failing to observe a maxim:

a) Flouting maxim

The implicature that arise because the addresser assumes that the speaker is abiding by Grice maxims, that the utterance is as informative as is possible, well founded, maximally relevant in its context and to be read in away that assumes perspicuity. But the thought has probably already gone through your mind that speakers don't always abide so rigorously by these maxims. The situation when a speaker blatantly fails to observe a maxim, not with any intention of deceiving, but because the speaker wishes to prompt the hearer to look for a meaning. A flout happen when a speaker blatantly fails to observe a maxim at the level of what is said, with deliberate intention of generating an implicature (Thomas, 1997: 65). Most of Grice's own examples of flouts involve this sort of exploitation:

(1) Flouts of quality maxim

Flouts which exploit the maxim of Quality occur when the speaker says something which is blatantly untrue or lack adequate evidence (Thomas, 1997: 67).

(2) Flouts of quantity maxim

A flout of the maxim quantity occurs when a speaker blatantly gives more or less information than the situation requires (Thomas, 1997: 69).

(3) Flouts of relation maxim

The maxim of relation is exploited by making a response or observation which is very obviously irrelevant to the topic in hand (Thomas, 1997: 70).

(4) Flouts of Manner maxim

The utterance that implicate flouts of manner maxim is used when the speaker is able to speak clearly. The utterance sometimes long utterance and convoluted (Thomas, 1997: 71)

2. Research Method

This study belongs to qualitative research where in collected data has been analyzed based on the conversational implicature theory and translation theory. The data was collected by watching *A Cinderella Story* and *The Perfect Man* movies and searching the script movies in the internet. Reading the script, then identifying maxim flouts in the script. The collected data is coded in order that easy to classify. Besides document, this study also uses questioner from three raters that have background study about translation. They give score the level of accuracy, acceptability, and readability for measuring the quality of translation. The researcher uses Nababan's method as standard scoring.

3. Findings

Dialogue 1

No : 16/ACS/2/03:48/MFQL

Carter : Shelby, baby, what's up? Yeah. Allow me to refresh your memory.
Zorro.

Apa kabar Shelby? Ya ijinkan aku menyegarkan ingatanmu. Zorro.

Shelby SL: ***You mean zero. Who is he?***

TL: ***Maksudmu zero. Siapa dia?***

Context : This scene located in poolside, Carter comes to Shelby to confess her identity. In the previous day, Carter meets Shelby in the halloween dance. Carter helped Shelby from David that seduces her, after that incident Shelby kisses him. Carter wears Zorro costume and he has not told her identity. Carter comes to Shelby, kiss her hand and also says *Shelby, baby, what's up? Yeah. Allow me to refresh your memory. Zorro.* Shelby looks shock, then pulls her hand and says her utterance. She pretends to hear wrong word and then she asks to her friends, about Carter identity.

Based on the analysis of the datum above, Shelby's utterance includes a flout of quality maxim. The reason is Shelby blatantly says word that she believes to be false. It shows from her shocked expression, and her gesture of pulling hand, and asking about Carter identity to her friends. Actually if she heard the word wrong she should ask to Carter, and her expression is not shocked. Her utterance implies that she is disappointed with the real identity of Zorro. The utterance *You mean zero. Who is he?* is translated into *Maksudmu zero. Siapa dia?* it means both contain flouts quality maxim.

Dialogue 2

No : 21/TPM/1/02:05/MFQN

Holly : I don't do yearbook photos.
Aku tak pernah foto untuk buku tahunan

Amy SL: ***You have no choice.It's like taxes and death.Mandatory pain.***
TL: ***Kau tak punya pilihan.Seperti pajak dan kematian. Rasa sakit yang diwajibkan***

Amy SL: ***If you don't do it yourself...they'll hunt you down like an animal and force you to smile.***
TL: ***Jika tak lakukan, mereka buru kau seperti hewan dan paksa kau senyum.***

Context: The dialogue occurs in the aisle of school. This is dialogue between Holly and Amy. Holly is new student in that school. She meets Amy one of the students that explain about yearbook photos program. Amy's utterance implicates yearbook photos program is a mandatory.

Based on Amy's utterance, the researcher can conclude that it belongs to flouts of quantity maxim. Amy's utterance blatantly gives more information than requires. She can say yearbook photos program must be done for all students, the

source language is translated as long as the target language, and it does not lost the flouts of quantity maxim. It is a proof that she flouts the maxim of quantity implied in both sentences.

Dialogue 3

No : 3/ACS/1/09:43/MFR

Customer: ...blueberry muffin and a Coke. Make it a Diet Coke. I'm trying to watch my weight.
...muffin blueberry and coke. Aku pesan Diet Coke. Aku mencoba menjaga berat badanku.

Rhonda SL: ***It ain't going nowhere.***

TL: ***Beratmu takkan kemana-mana.***

Context : This is dialogue between a customer and a waiter in the restourant. A fat man orders food and beverage to Rhonda. He worries about his weight. He orders blueberry muffin and a Coke, then he says "Make it a Diet Coke. I'm trying to watch my weight". Then, Rhonda says utterance above. Her utterance implies joke to the customer.

From the analysis of the datum above, Rhonda's utterance belongs to flouts of relation maxim. She blantatly responds which is not related to the topic. Her utterance implies to joke with the customer. *It ain't going nowhere* is translated into *Beratmu takkan kemana-mana*. It is a proof of source language and target language include the flouts of relation maxim.

Dialogue 4

No : 1/ACS/1/07:20/ MFM

Brianna : I have a spastic colon.
: Aku kejang usus.

Gabriella SL : ***Well, you have a spastic brain.***

TL : ***Otakmu yang kejang.***

Context : The sentence is spoken by Gabriella in the swimming pool. The dialogue between Brianna and Gabriella speaks when they practice water aerobic. Brianna moves her position in front of Gabriella and suddenly Brianna is fart. Gabriela feels abhorrent. Brianna says, "I have a spastic colon", but Gabriella has been angry and sunk Brianna head with says her utterance. Gabriella's utterance implicates she says "stupid".

The researcher analyzes that Gabriella's utterance belongs to flout of manner maxim. The reason is Brianna can simply say stupid, but her response is convoluted. The expression of *Well, you have a spastic brain* is translated into *Otakmu yang kejang*, so this utterance has failed to observe maxim manner in source language and target language.

Dialogue 5

No : 13/ACS/1/47:08/MFR

Sam : Carter, you could've totally made that light.
Carter, kau bisa lewati lampu merah itu.

Carter : Sam, yellow means slow down, okay? Not speed up.
Sam, kuning berarti pelan-pelan bukan tancap gas.

Sam SL : ***I need The Fast and the Furious, not Driving Miss Daisy.***

TL : ***Aku butuh Fast and Furious bukan Driving Miss Daisy.***

Context : This conversation between Carter and Rhonda occur in Carter's car. Carter and Sam back to restaurant in hurry, because at 12 o'clock her stepmother will back to restaurant. Carter carries his father car very slowly, he afraid something happens with the car. Yellow light on, Carter

stops in front of the traffic light. Sam says "Carter, you could've totally made that light." Carter says "Sam, yellow means slow down, okay? Not speed up." Then Sam says utterance above, because she is afraid her mother will arrive earlier. "The fast and the furious" is title of action movie about race car, than "Driving Miss Daisy" is title of drama movie about old lady and her driver. That utterance implies that Sam wants Carter to drive in high speed.

In the subtitling above, the sentence is classified into accurately. Although some words are not translated into Indonesian, it does not influence the level of accurate. When *The Fast and the Furious* and *Driving Miss Daisy* is translated into Indonesian, it makes the watcher hard to catch the message and a flout of relation maxim is vanishing. The message of source language to target language does not decrease, and support this datum includes accurate.

Dialogue 6

No : 10/ACS/1/30:59/MFQL

Gabriella : I cannot believe I put you in charge of costumes.
Aku tak percaya mempercayakan kostumku padamu.

Gabriella : I told you Siamese cats, not Siamese twins.
Sudah kubilang kucing siam, bukan kucing kembar siam.

Brianna SL: ***Are we having a catfight?***
TL: ***Kita bertengkar seperti kucing.***

Context : This dialogue between Gabriela and Brianna, that come to the party. They wear Siamese twins costume that has one body, two heads and two hands. So, they always move together in the party. Gabriella is very angry to Brianna because she brings wrong costume. Brianna's utterance implicates she wants Gabriela stops complain.

From the analysis of the datum above, Brianna's utterance belongs to less acceptable. One rater agrees that the translator translates source language acceptable to target language, but others rater do not agree. The reason is the form of the source sentence different from the target language sentence, and can not show the complaining from Brianna. Moreover, the flouts of quality maxim is vanishing. The sentence should be *Apa kita harus bertengkar seperti kucing?*

Dialogue 7

No : 39/TPM/1/25:12/MFQL

Dolores SL : ***Hey, Jean. This has your name written all over it.***

TL : ***Jean, ini cocok untukmu***

Context : Dolores knows Jean has special talent in making cake. Dolores meets Jean in the kitchen. She gives form cake competition and says her utterance. Dolores says sentence that she knows it false. Jean's name has not written in the form yet, but Dolores says the opposite. Dolores says sentence that she knows it false, but it implies she commands Jean to join the cake competition.

Three raters give score 3 in readability to this utterance. The translator can sort the utterance in the source language. The sentence *This has your name written all over it* is translated into *ini cocok untukmu*. Based on the context, the viewer will confuse, if the translator translate the real meaning of words. Although the translator changes the meaning, but it makes the sentence belongs to readable.

The first finding is the classification of maxim flouts in subtitling of *A Cinderella Story*, and *The Perfect Man* movies. In the source language data, the researcher finds four types of maxim flouts in Grice theory, there are flouts of quality maxim, flouts of quantity maxim, flouts of relation maxim, and flouts of

manner maxim. The types of maxim flouts in *A Cinderella Story* are flouts of quality maxim, flouts of relation maxim and flouts of manner maxim. Then in *The Perfect Man* movie flouts of quality maxim, flouts of quantity maxim, flouts of relation maxim, and flouts of manner maxim.

Based on the analysis of the table, the number of Maxim flout of quality is mostly found in both movies. The sequence of the using maxim flouts in both movies are flouts of quality maxim in the first position, which has 38 data from 57 maxim flouts data or about 66.67 %. The second sequence is flouts of relation maxim that has 12 data or about 21.05%. The third is flouts of manner maxim, which has 4 data or 7.01%. In the last sequence is flout of quantity maxim. It has 3 data or about 5.26%.

Moreover, the result of translation sometimes does not imply maxim flouts of source language. The flouts of quantity maxim, relation maxim, and manner maxim still appear in target language. The exception is the flouts in quality maxim. From 38 data that imply flouts of quality maxim, after it is translated into target language 8 data do not imply flouts of quality maxim.

The second is the accuracy of maxim flouts translation in *A Cinderella Story* and *The Perfect Man* movies. The average of accuracy in maxim flouts data is 2.75. From 57 data, the number of accurate data is 31 or about 54.38 %, and the number

of less accurate data is 26 or about 45.61 %. It can be seen that the number of accurate data is higher than less accurate but the difference only five data. It means almost half of maxim flouts data less accurate.

The third is the acceptability of maxim flouts translation in *A Cinderella Story* and *The Perfect Man* movies. All flouts of manner maxim data can get score acceptable. Then, the level of acceptable in flouts of quality maxim and relation maxim data is higher than less acceptable. On the other hand, flouts of quantity maxim have less acceptable higher than acceptable data. The number of acceptable data is higher than less acceptable. It means the level of acceptable maxim flouts data is good, because 36 or about 63.16% maxim flouts data are acceptable for the viewer. Then 21 data or 36.84 % are less acceptable. The average score of acceptable is 2.85. The level of acceptability in each movie also has level of acceptable higher than less acceptable.

The fourth is the readability of maxim flouts translation in *A Cinderella Story* and *The Perfect Man* Movies. The average score of readability is 2.79. From 57 data that is analyzed, and the result is 31 or about 54.38% data readable, and 26 or about 45.61%. It means nearly half of maxim flouts are less readable.

4. Conclusion

The most commonly found type in both movies is flouts of quality maxim. The number of accurate data is higher than less accurate. The level of acceptable in maxim flouts of quality and relation data is higher than less acceptable. On the other hand, maxim flouts of quantity have less acceptable higher than acceptable data. The number of acceptable data is higher than less acceptable, and nearly half of maxim flouts data are less readable.

References

- Baker, Mona. 1992. *In Other Words: a Coursebook on Translation*. New York: Roudledge.
- Bernschuz, Maria. 2009. "Empirical Study of Subtitled Movies". <http://www.translationdirectory.com/articles/article2145.php> at 10.28 p.m in 11 April 2010.
- Catford, J.C. 2004. *A Linguistics Theory of Translation: an Essay on Applied Linguistics*. Moscow: Editorial URSS.
- Cummings, Louise. 1999. *Pragmatics, a multidisciplinary Perspective*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Drew. 2005. "Cinderella Story Script-Dialogue Transcript". www.script-orama.com/movie_scripts/c/cinderellastory-script-transcript at 7.20 pm in 26 March 2009
- Drew. 2007. "The Perfect Man Script-Dialogue Transcript". http://www.script-orama.com/movie_scripts/p/perfect-man-script-transcript-duff.html at 7.26 am 04 September 2013
- Fadee, Elahea. 2011. "Translation naturalness in literary works: English to Persian". www.academicjournals.org/ijel/PDF/Pdf2011/Dec/Fadaee.pdf at 12.06 am 11 March 2013.
- Ghaemi, Farid and Janin Benyamin. 2010. "Strategies Used in the Translation of Interlingual Subtitling in journal of English Studies".

www.sid.ir/en/VEWSSID/J_pdf/1024220100103.pdf at 2.13 pm 27 February 2013.

Hashemi, hamide. 2008. "Naturalness in translation". <http://www.proz.com/translation-articles/articles/2825/1/Naturalness-in-translation> at 3.15 pm 27 February 2013

Hatim, B. 2001. *Teaching and researching translation*. New York : Longman.

Karamitroglou, Fotios. 2007. "A Proposed Set of Subtitling Standards in Europe." *Translation Journal*. <http://accurapid.com/journal/04standard.htm> 12.37 a.m in 11 April 2010

Larson, Mildread. 1998. *Meaning based translation workbook: Biblical Exercises*.

Levinson, Stephen C. 1983. *Pragmatics*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Nababan, Mangatur. 2003. *Teori Menterjemah Bahasa Inggris*. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar.

Nababan, Mangatur. 2004. *Translation Processes, Practices, and Product of Profesional*. Cambridge University.

_____. 2008. "Equivalence in Translation: Some Problem-Solving Strategies" .<http://www.proz.com/translation-articles> at 5.13 a.m in 29 April 2009.

Nababan, Nuraeni, & Sumardiono. 2010. " Pengembangan Model Penilaian Kualitas Terjemahan." (Ringkasan Hasil Penelitian). Surakarta : Universitas Sebelas Maret.

Maslahah, Frida Alfani. 2010. *An analysis of deletion strategy in subtitling entitled A Cinderella Story*. Surakarta: Muhammadiyah University of Surakarta.

Mc Guire, Susan B. 1991. *Translation Studies*. London and New York: Routledge.

Moleong, Lexy J. 1989. *Metodologi Penelitian Kualitatif* . Bandung: PT. Remaja Rosdakarya.

Napis, Ahmad. 2008. *A Study of Hedging and Flouting of Conversational Maxim in the Movie of John Tucker Must Die*. Malang: State Islamic University of Malang.

- Nida, E.A and Ch.R. Taber.1969. *The theory and practice of translation.Helps for Translator*. Den Hag: Brill.
- Nurkamto, Joko. 2004. *Metodologi Penelitian Kuantitatif*. Materi Kuliah.
- Munday, Jeremy. 2001. *Introducing Translation Studies*. London: Routledge Taylor and Francis Group.
- Pop, Anisoara. 2010."Implicature derived through maxim flouting in print advertising: A contrastive empirical approach." <https://twpl.library.utoronto.ca/index.php/twpl/article/view/6653> at 05.30 pm 07 March 2014
- Supana. 2012. *Kajian Terjemahan penanda kohesi pada novel Wings karya Daniel Steel ke dalam bahasa Indonesia*. Surakarta : Universitas Sebelas Maret.
- Sutopo, H. B. 2006. *Metode Penelitian Kualitatif. Dasar Teori Penerapan Dalam Penelitian*: Surakarta: UNS Press.
- Sumardiono. 2011. *Kajian terjemahan ujaran yang mengandung implikatur pada novel The Da Vinci Code*. Surakarta: Universitas Sebelas Maret.
- Thomas, Jenny. 1995. *Meaning in Interaction: an Introduction to Pragmatics*. England: Longman.
- Yan, Huang. 2007. *Pragmatics*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.